

Urbact Markets

Low Carbon and Local Supply Chains Thematic Guidelines

Alison Partridge, August 2013



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. INTRODUCTION TO THE TOPIC	3
3. PRIORITIES OF EACH PARTNER ON THE TOPIC	6
4. SOME RELEVANT GOOD PRACTICES	8
5. ANALYSIS OF GOOD PRACTICE AND RELEVANCE TO URBACT MARKETS.....	14
6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	17



1. BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION

URBACT Markets is a project on how the city retail markets can become drivers of social, environmental and economic change. Markets generate footfall, economic activity, increase in trade in surrounding areas, incentivise tourism and reinforce local cohesion.

The project focuses on sharing best practice for creating and managing both street and covered market, either food or specialist markets. Its main objective is to help partner cities to establish a local action plan for their markets development. This strategic plan will be developed and agreed with public and private market's stakeholders, in order to support its feasibility and assure its maximum consensus.

Urbact Markets is structured in 3 main themes:

- Town Centre Regeneration
- Low Carbon Economy
- Employment and Entrepreneurship

Each of these will be integrated in the partners' Local Action Plans taking into account the needs and capacities of each city.

A set of 3 Thematic Guidelines have been developed to support this process. This document - the Low Carbon Economy Thematic Guidelines includes:

- An introduction to the topic and an outline of the scope covered
- Summary of the priorities of the 10 partner cities
- Examples of relevant good practice from within and outside the partnership



- Analysis drawing out which approaches might be relevant / transferable to partner cities
- Conclusions and recommendations

The guidelines have been developed as a result of extensive desk work, telephone interviews with URBACT Markets Partners, interviews with a number of market experts and a group discussion at the project meeting in Dublin in July 2013.



2. INTRODUCTION TO THE TOPIC

The Baseline Study highlighted two key sub themes in the field of the low carbon economy. These are:

a) Rural - Urban links incorporating:

- promotion of local food production and km0 products
- promotion of farmers' markets
- development of 'green' and local brands

b) Resource efficiency incorporating:

- promotion of sustainable mobility for customers and stall holders
- waste management and minimisation
- energy efficiency and use of renewables

In the process of consulting partners on these thematic guidelines the focus of the topic has developed further to more explicitly incorporate the development of local supply chains and brokerage of local suppliers / buyers to create economies of scale with environmental benefits e.g. consolidation of deliveries etc

In addition there is a recognition that first key sub theme is not just about rural-urban linkages rather the focus is on these local supply chains / food production and zero km food.

Each of the sub themes is further defined below. The focus is on areas where markets and their managers (whether public and

private) have some control or influence rather than on generic city policies or practices.

a) Local Supply Chains

Local food can be defined as a "collaborative effort to build more locally based, self-reliant food economies - one in which sustainable food production, processing, distribution, and consumption is integrated to enhance the economic, environmental and social health of a particular place."ⁱ It is part of the concept of local purchasing and local economies; a preference to buy locally produced goods and services rather than those produced by corporate institutions.

Locally produced food is generally considered to be more environmentally friendly because of the minimal processing and the fact it is produced and consumed in season and locally grown. In addition the energy needed to store, refrigerate and transport perishable foods is also reduced. However the debate on the sustainability of growing local food in large cities of urban areas continues - with some arguing that actually the effects on the environment are marginal or even detrimental, the real benefits being mostly in terms of education and awareness raising - leading to a more environmentally conscious population.

A **farmers' market** is a physical retail market featuring foods sold directly by farmers to consumers. Farmers' markets typically consist of booths, tables or stands, outdoors or indoors, where farmers sell fruits, vegetables, meats, and sometimes prepared foods and beverages.

Farmers markets tend to cut out intermediaries and wholesalers, bring produce from 'farm to fork' and reduce the environmental costs involved in long distance transportation, refrigeration, marketing and promotion.

Linked to this the development of local supply chains and brokerage of local suppliers / buyers to create economies of scale with environmental benefits is a growing priority for markets. This includes consolidation of

deliveries using sustainable transport, for example.

In some parts of Europe there are concerns that farmers' markets are actually selling mass produced food rather than locally sourced produce. This has led to many markets considering better quality assurance or certification programmes to guarantee that purchasers are getting high quality local produce.

b) Resource efficiency

Promotion of sustainable mobility for consumers and stall holders is a priority in many cities. Sustainable mobility for consumers includes measures to encourage and facilitate non-motorised forms of transport e.g. cycling through provision of cycle storage facilities. Dedicated public transport/shuttle services linked to real time information systems in the markets themselves also exist - to help people access markets easily without relying on private car use.

Sustainable mobility for stall holders can include electrically-fuelled vehicles to reduce emissions. As mentioned above, in some cases stall holders have come together to consolidate their deliveries or buying. This reduces the number of trips by delivery vehicles or those going to purchase products elsewhere.

Waste management and minimisation mainly concerns the separation of waste for recycling / composting; reduction in the use of packaging and the use of recycled/biodegradable packaging. Many markets have put in place recycling facilities to separate waste so that it can be recycled or disposed of appropriately. Some even manage to convert waste into a resource for future use elsewhere. 'No bag' schemes are also quite widespread to reduce the waste from plastic carrier bags.

Energy efficiency and use of renewables in markets mainly concerns covered markets which use more energy and also provide more scope for facilities such as solar panels. Use of LED lighting is a way of increasing energy

efficiency for both indoor and outdoor markets. Smart metering is a way of raising awareness of energy use and efficiency

opportunities. There are also examples of markets using geothermal energy for both heating and cooling.

	Air quality									
	Energy efficiency									
	Sustainable mobility and consolidate freight deliveries									
Other	Development of website to buy market produce online									

The table shows that are lots of areas of common interest and a number of priorities which are relevant to several partners. Local food production,

sustainable mobility and waste management are the most common priorities.



4. SOME RELEVANT GOOD PRACTICES

This section summarises relevant good practices identified both within and outside URBACT Markets.

[4.1. From the 'URBACT Markets' partners](#)

4.1.1. Barcelona markets

In 1997, the markets of Barcelona (with a significant volume of waste due to a range of products centred on fresh food) adopted a model of waste separation in two main groups: organic material (food waste) and non-organic. Waste reduction results are impressive with markets producing 28% less waste in the period from 2001 to 2012. The percentage of recycled waste has also maintained an upward trend: from 20% in 2002 to more than 40% in 2012.

To encourage recycling, the Council has promoted complementary initiatives, such as specific regulations, an awareness-raising plan for traders and a logistical space structuring plan. The different markets in the municipal network have also implemented different initiatives to invigorate the culture of recycling and sustainability among consumers, resulting in some publicity campaigns, centralised collection of batteries and campaigns for collection of used clothing.

During 2010 and 2011 Barcelona's markets ran two campaigns to reduce plastic bag usage. 400,000 reusable bags were distributed and early estimates suggest that the reduction in plastic bag usage has been as high as 30 million.

Barcelona has also done a lot of work in the field of energy efficiency and renewables. It has, for example, installed air conditioning systems which use ground water / geothermal energy; photovoltaic panels and thermal insulation on facades and roofs. In the Carmel Market the 318m² PV cells and micro energy plant generates an average annual production of 55,000 kwh with the estimated gross saving being around €28 000 or 25 tonnes of CO₂. LED lighting is installed in 2 markets and lighting timers and motion detectors are also being introduced.

The [Institut Municipal de Mercats de Barcelona](#) (IMMB), carries out a series of training and information activities, aimed at children and youths, organised in the programme *Per mantenir l'equilibri, menjo de mercat!* (for a balanced diet, I buy at the market!). The educational programme of Barcelona, a pilot project designed jointly by the IMMB and the Department of Trade at the Diputació de Barcelona, seeks to teach pupils from city schools, aged 6 to 16, the concept that markets have fundamental values as a space of social relations, with the presence of local, quality and healthy products and also as a space for promoting forms of responsible and sustainable consumption.

A parallel initiative - 'Cooking by making the most of food' uses workshops and theatrical events to highlight how food is wasted in households and the consequences of this waste. It introduces new food habits and promotes good practice in preventing the generation of waste when shopping and

cooking.

Alongside this Barcelona has developed an [app for smart phones](#) which show users e.g. where the nearest market is; how to get there; what is available there and how to use the produce to cook new recipes.

4.1.2. Suceava - Sustainable Energy Action Plan (RO)

The city's Sustainable Energy Action Plan aims to introduce a clean heating system within the Commercial Complex Bazaar and is funded within the Swiss-Romanian Cooperation Programme. A range of feasibility work is in progress looking at various options for energy efficiency and use of renewables (solar and geothermal). The city is also exploring options to use compost waste to generate power. The aim is that it will become a forerunner and a good example to multiply such investments.

4.1.3. Wroclaw's Markets (PL)

The city of Wroclaw implemented a pilot programme (2006-2008) in cooperation with Heating Company to install new central heating system in old tenent buildings (old town area).

During 2012 they also ran a series of awareness raising initiatives with children and young people in the city's schools to help them better understand the benefits of healthy eating and how to re-use food which may otherwise be wasted e.g. with different recipes etc.

4.1.4. London's markets (UK)

In London a few markets such as [Borough market](#) have successfully developed waste strategies, and encourage recycling and composting and reduction of non recyclable/non biodegradable packaging.





The [London farmers' markets](#) association adheres to the 'rules' set out by the UK Farmers' Retail and Markets Association, leading to the accreditation of a market as farmer market. One of the criteria is the goods that are sold in farmers markets in London must be raised, grown, produced, gathered, caught, or baked within 100 miles of the M25 ('the Region'). There are actually 13 accredited farmers' markets in London.

[New Covent Garden Markets](#) (a wholesale market in London) actively look to help people 'back haul' when delivering produce to retail markets. This means that they broker relationships between small producers / growers and freight delivery companies and promote consolidation of deliveries. - e.g. take stuff out when delivering e.g. if small grower in Brighton growing niche product, NCMA will work with them & map permit data to identify hauliers within 10 miles radius & then encourage them to make contact with these hauliers. Similarly local street traders which buy regularly from the wholesale market are encouraged to develop a consolidated buying group based on a cluster of local food businesses and then to buy in bulk - thereby achieving better value for money, improving logistics and reducing the number of journeys.

On a much smaller scale, [Marky Markets](#) (@markymarket) is an individual who takes orders from small food companies and restaurants and then buys from large wholesale markets using public transport and

hired electric vehicles. He works out of a pub in Soho, London!

New Covent Garden Market also has a Schools Project to increase young people's understanding of the food supply chain and give children direct experience of growing food. Working in partnership with Wandsworth Council, it combined farm visits, visits to the wholesale market and a sustainable gardening competition in schools.

4.1.5. Torino's markets (IT)

In the greatest part of [Torino markets](#) infrastructure for the separate sorting and collection of organic waste, crates, plastic and paper has been installed. This has increased the amount of waste that is recycled.

The city is also delivering a series of new initiatives focusing on behaviour change - to better promote the use of the these facilities by consumers and traders - thereby further increasing waste minimisation and recycling.

The City of Torino has recently opened the VOV 102, the first farmers' market in Torino, thanks to a partial funding from a Regional tender, won by the City of Torino in partnership with [Coldiretti](#) (farmers association) and Enzo B Association (which owns the license for the area). The funds for such investments are thus public and private.

4.1.6. Toulouse's markets (FR)

In 2012, the Metropolitan Toulouse Urban Community and the Chamber of Agriculture signed a 'Semi-urban agriculture Charter'. The ultimate aim of this Charter is to preserve land resources and agricultural usage in order to meet the population's demand for local, high quality foodstuffs.

Toulouse is also home to an impressive Christmas Markets. Service providers at the market must meet the conditions for sustainable development to obtain the "sustainable event" municipal label, according to the charter for environmentally responsible

events. To do so, they must make sure they employ the most energy-efficient lighting, use certified materials (chalets, furniture, cleaning products, etc.) and provide collection points for the recycling of electrical and electronic waste and domestic electrical appliances.

Toulouse is also doing a lot of work on freight consolidation. For example a transport centre with nearly 200 parking spaces has been created which enables heavy-goods vehicles to park on the outskirts of the city in the evening before their consignment is delivered to the city centre in small vans the next morning. In addition, a goods delivery charter has been adopted. One of its objectives is to organise the deliveries in the city centre to relieve traffic congestion and encourage the use of low-impact transport (electric delivery tricycles).

4.2. Some relevant practice from outside the partnership

This section of the guidelines presents a few examples of relevant practice from outside the URBACT Markets partnership. The focus is on identifying just a few new and different experiences which might provide inspiration and / or food for thought for URBACT Markets cities.

4.2.1. Bolton - market redevelopment (UK)

Bolton Council is delivering a range of activities to 'green' the town's covered market - taking advantage of a major redevelopment plan which offers a golden moment approach in terms of developing a new, greener approach. Specific activities include:

- Introduction of solar powered smart



dustbins - to make waste collection more efficient. A suite of bins have been installed which have compressors inside to hugely increase their capacity. They also automatically send message to the town's waste collection service when 80% full and ready for collection. More information on the supplier is at <http://www.bigbellysolar.co.uk>

- Installation of large public screens in the market which provide real time traffic information on public transport and aim to increase the number of people who leave their cars at home
- Installation of photo voltaic cells in the market's new roof - the new roof costs £900,000 and the town has secured a further £150,000 grant to integrate PVs. The forecast annual saving on the market's electricity bill is £100,000 and the saving will be passed onto traders through a reduction in rent.
- Replacement of all lighting with low energy LED and promotion of the use of oil filled heaters rather than electric fans
- Installation of smart meters in all market units for both electricity and water
- Development of a new Tenants Handbook which will be attached to the Occupancy Agreement and used it as a tool to change behaviour e.g. information on refuse collection / sorting
- Piloting of an electronic loyalty card with 10 market businesses which gives 10% back on all purchases and also collects information on consumer behaviour / movements using geo mapping technology
- Promotion of 'Taste of Lancashire' label for local foods



- Introduction of Food and Cookery Courses run by local health service nutritionist which use seasonal recipes and produce sold at the market. The finished dishes are then test traded in the market and all participants given a loyalty card so that buying behaviour can be tracked and reviewed to see if habits are sustainable / lasting'

4.2.2. 'How Green is your Market?' National Market Traders Association Annual Award (UK)

a) *Ashton-under-Lyne market, Greater Manchester (population: 43,200) (and Boston Market, Lincolnshire – population 65,000).*

Ashton-under-Lyne market won the award in 2012 in recognition of its waste management work through which it managed to reduce the amount of waste going to landfill by over 50% in a two year period. It introduced cardboard recycling and the Council's recycling service holds regular road shows in the market hall to promote different green schemes. In an imaginative new initiative, the council enlisted the help of a century-old horse-drawn refuse wagon to highlights its hundred year track record of waste management.

b) *Chesham Market, Buckinghamshire (Population 22,000)*

Chesham's local produce market won the award in 2011 in recognition of the work it has done to promote local food production. The majority of traders come from within a 10-mile radius of Chesham and have the environment in mind when farming or making their projects, from organic cultivation to tree-planting and recycling. Building on the town's green credentials a new specialist market was set up in 2012 focussing on selling re-manufactured recycled and reused goods. The new market also needed a new logo and the organisers invited young budding artists to submit their ideas. The logo represents the market's ecological ethics.

In addition Chesham Green Living Fair 2011, was held to coincide with the first anniversary of the Local produce Market. Stalls offered free

advice on issues such as composting, local walks and conservation, reducing energy use, and greener transport. Displays were on show from local schools about these environmental issues and people were invited to contribute their ideas for the future of Chesham (ideas were provided on cycle routes, free solar panels, a renewable geothermal energy centre etc).

4.2.3. New Farmer's markets, Prague (CZ)

In Prague the number of farmer's markets grew from zero to more than twenty in a year, due to commitment of the local government in Prague and work of NGOs (e.g. Czech Environmental Partnership Foundation). Unlike other European cities with centuries-old public market traditions, in Prague, for the last few decades, there were few places to buy fresh, locally produced food. The legacy of communism in Prague presented unique challenges to establishing farmers markets.

Working with the 'Project for Public Spaces', a US based organisation, which has been promoting farmers markets in central and eastern Europe since the 1990s, Prague has seen a resurgence in farmer's markets. This has developed new urban-rural links; has redefined the use of space in the city and has spurred on green mobility improvements.

This resurgence of farmers markets in Prague highlights the complexity of the urban-rural linkages that sustain markets in cities everywhere: under communism, most Czech farms were collectivized- there simply weren't many small scale farms geared to grow goods for sale at markets. In their first year, in 2010, farmers were just learning what customers wanted and often ran out of popular products. In 2011, opening for their second season, local farmers began growing produce specifically to sell at markets. Farmers are pleased with the change since selling directly to consumers means a healthier profit margin than wholesale.

These markets have provided the impetus to bring new life to some of Prague's

neighbourhood public squares which, until the markets were established, had not really thrived as community centres. Markets have even become a draw for tourists. Creating farmers markets has been a great way to turn previously dysfunctional spaces into thriving community spaces, as they allow land that cannot be built on (e.g. due to flooding) to have a purpose, as no permanent structures are needed.

Since the area has been re-cobbled and fitted with bike lanes that connect to a Greenway extending over 20 km south of Prague, many shoppers can now also arrive by bike.

4.2.3. Union Square Green Market, New York (USA)

[Union Square GreenMarket](#), New York is a globally renowned example of an organic market in a city centre. Greenmarket was founded in 1976 with a two-fold mission: to promote regional agriculture by providing small family farms the opportunity to sell their locally grown products directly to consumers, and to ensure that all New Yorkers have access to the freshest, most nutritious locally grown food the region has to offer.

What began over three decades ago with 12 farmers in a parking lot on 59th Street and 2nd Avenue in Manhattan has now grown to become the largest and most diverse outdoor

urban farmers market network in the country, now with 54 markets, over 230 family farms and fishermen participating, and over 30,000 acres of farmland protected from development.

This unique relationship between farmers and city residents has not only changed the face of regional agriculture; it has revitalised rural communities and urban spaces, improved consumer health, provided fresh and nutritious food to those most in need through our Electric Benefit Transfer Cards (EBT)/Food Stamp and Youth market programs, supported immigrant farmers, encouraged crop diversity, educated school children and city residents about the importance of regional agriculture, provided a wholesale opportunity for medium sized farms, inspired new culinary trends, and influenced chefs and eaters in one of the culinary capitals in the world.

4.2.4. Budapest Markets (HU)

Budapest is home to a [wide range of markets](#) - mostly fruit and vegetable and food markets with an emphasis on bio products. The marketing is interesting as there is as much emphasis on eating and cooking as there is on shopping with one strapline reading:

'better for eating out than shopping'

There are a wide range of local and bio food related events including national gastro days and a street food gastro festival.

Bio markets sell local fruits, vegetables, jams, honey, dairy products and meat from certified producers who grow their produce and raise animals within strictly controlled ecological farming. The information available to visitors acknowledges that these products are more expensive than others but explains some of the benefits of this approach to food production.



5. ANALYSIS OF GOOD PRACTICE AND RELEVANCE TO URBACT MARKETS

The work undertaken in preparation of these guidelines suggests that the low carbon angle is a relatively under explored / under developed theme. Whilst there is some good practice in some of the sub themes, there are actually not that many examples of radically different or ground breaking approaches to low carbon markets.

URBACT Markets partners are making progress in the right direction and there are a few noteworthy examples from outside the partnership. These offer some potential for learning and provide a foundation from which URBACT Markets partners can come together to develop new ideas and approaches.

[Experiences of potential interest to partners](#)

The following table identifies some of the practices that partners have experienced in their markets. They are matched against the partner's priorities to identify which practices may be of potential interest for knowledge sharing and possibly transfer.

A simple colour coding system is used to identify how easily transferable the practice may be to another city.

- 'Green' indicates that a practice should be easily transferable without significant cost or barrier;
- 'Orange' indicates that a practice may be transferable but there may be a potential

barrier to overcome such as cost or need for strong political commitment;

- 'Red' indicates that a practice is unlikely to be transferable due to the unique context in which it was put into place in the host city.

green	• Practice transferable without significant cost / barrier
orange	• Practice transferable with some cost / barrier
red	• Practice unlikely to be transferable

Host partner	Host partner examples of experience	Attica	Barcelona	Dublin	London	Pecs	Suceava	Torino	Toulouse	Wroclaw
Barcelona	Waste management – separation / collection points									
	Waste management - regulations									
	Waste management – awareness raising plan and logistical space structuring plan									
	Training and information activities aimed at young people to promote markets as space for social relations, responsible and sustainable consumption.									
	Energy efficiency and Renewable Energy									
Suceava	Energy efficiency and Renewable Energy - Sustainable energy action plan									
Wroclaw	Energy efficiency – Installation of new central heating system in old tenant building									
	Awareness raising campaign in city schools on how to re-use food which may otherwise be wasted									
London	Waste management – waste strategies, recycling, composting, reduction of non recyclable/non biodegradable packaging.									
	Local food – accreditation of farmers markets									
Torino	Waste management – separation for recycling									
	Waste management – behaviour change initiatives									
	Local food – gaining public and private funding for the first farmers' market									

From this analysis, the locations that seem to offer greatest potential for tangible exchange and learning opportunities seem to be Barcelona, Turin and London.

Perhaps an early priority for the partnership therefore could be to organise study visits to these cities for interested partners. These will in turn generate new discussions and dialogue from which future visits could be planned.



6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

These Thematic Guidelines have aimed to:

- clarify the definition of the Low Carbon Economy for URBACT Markets
- highlight key partner priorities
- present some good practice in the low carbon field from within and outside the partnership
- demonstrate the potential areas of exchange and transfer for the remainder of the project

What is interesting to note from the work undertaken is the sense that the infrastructure / technical solutions are known and, in many cases, in place or at least planned. However

results and impact continue to be patchy. Perhaps therefore a key priority moving forward is the concept of behaviour change - the ability to get citizens to change the way their lives their lives, the way that they shop, cook etc or the ability to get stallholders and market managers to consider the environment when setting up their stall, using it and then taking it down at the end of the day.

At the same time it is clear that markets - and their stakeholders - are generally not large corporations and have hugely diverse priorities. Environment on its own does not seem to figure high on the list of these - particularly for the traders themselves. The key drivers for

change when it comes to the environment seem rather to be economic, customer or legislation driven. The challenge is to identify these drivers and use them to seek and find environmental benefits.

'To get engagement and buy in from companies we have to be solving a problem or issue they are struggling with' (Helen Evans, New Covent Garden Markets and member of London URBACT Local Support Group)

The link between so called 'green' markets and healthy living is a useful one in this debate and many of the examples of good practice identified link the two agendas through e.g. cooking demonstrations in the markets using fresh seasonal produce or other awareness raising campaigns about the benefits of cooking and eating good local food from small producers.

It is clear is that sustainable markets will only happen within a wider integrated plan for sustainable cities. Solutions need to be co created with all relevant stakeholders and preferably piloted on a small scale before being rolled out. The work undertaken in preparing these guidelines suggests that the key will be to keep things simple and achievable. One co creation technique that partners could consider is to use the URBACT Local Support Group and action planning process to jointly develop a diagram or model of an idealised low carbon market.

What is clear is that markets have a significant role to play in helping to build a low carbon economy and strong communities. They can increase the sense of pride of place, contribute to the healthy living agenda, raise awareness about the benefits of buying local produce and thereby increase environmental responsibility amongst a wide range of stakeholders.

In addition markets can be a factor for urban regeneration of brownfield sites and a catalyst for further environmental improvements in the area (e.g. improving infrastructure, public transport services etc).

URBACT Market partners will use these guidelines to consider how best to progress the local carbon economy in their Local Action Plans, taking into consideration existing practice from within and outside the project partnership; accounting for local context, challenges, drivers and opportunities and probably including both 'carrots' (positive incentives) and 'sticks' (legislation).

URBACT II

URBACT is a European exchange and learning programme promoting sustainable urban development.

It enables cities to work together to develop solutions to major urban challenges, reaffirming the key role they play in facing increasingly complex societal challenges. It helps them to develop pragmatic solutions that are new and sustainable, and that integrate economic, social and environmental dimensions. It enables cities to share good practices and lessons learned with all professionals involved in urban policy throughout Europe. URBACT is 181 cities, 29 countries, and 5,000 active participants

<http://urbact.eu/en/projects/urban-renewal/urbact-markets/homepage/>

ⁱ Feenstra, G. (2002) Creating space for sustainable food systems: lessons from the field. Agriculture and Human Values 19(2) 99-106